| **Student Name:** Dana Chung |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This would require defendants in criminal trials to be represented exclusively by public defenders |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  I appreciate the immediate clarification of the status quo in the hook on what public defenders are, with the differences in incentives being wages and motivation.   * Good expansion of the state having finite resources has led to public defenders being underpaid and overworked.   + Just bear in mind that the same state will then have to compensate ALL criminal defenders, so this problem gets extenuated.   On your set-up:   * Well done setting up the minimum requirements, and criminal defendants have some degree of autonomy.   + Why did we set this up so they get paid extra? Then the rich will still have advantages. Is this fee set very low? Then it’s still going to be first come first serve.   + Instead, we should just give them 2-3 vetoes, but they cannot actively choose. * You can suggest that high-stakes, high-profile cases will receive a specific public defender to match the level of case to the level of defender. * What is the winning pathway? Are we aiming for complete structural rehaul?   On the first argument:   * Good job laying down the wealth inequality in the system. * The impact statement needs to go beyond “it’s unfair” and poor people do not get equal defense.   + We need to explain that good lawyers are the only vanguard against biased judges and a legal system stacked against the poor.   + Point out how racial minorities get targeted by the police, and they need a good defense to not be pushed into the cycle of incarceration.   + We need to explain how bad lawyers force minorities into false plea deals of guilt when they are actually innocent. * Well done on explaining how rich people get away with their crimes!   + Now expand this to explain that the rich are often the ones who abuse the most laws in society and they are never held accountable.   On the second argument:   * While it’s true that the right to self-defend is compromised, it isn’t clear how you’re not just expanding this harm to every person in the system since everyone will now suffer from this system!   + Our impact statement is completely overlapping with the first argument!     - We need to point out why the miscarriage of justice is completely contradictory to the larger goal of the criminal justice system.   We never had a coherent defense on how your system will survive with the lack of funding!   * We can suggest that the state will have more incentives to fund the system if every rich and powerful person’s rights are also affected.   Please offer even more POIs!  5.13 - Good timing. | | | | | | |